Slope stability management within a tailings (Dam) Safety Management System

18 October 2018
Abstract

The implementation of a robust Dam Safety Management System (DSMS) for tailings includes many elements, with slope stability analysis and monitoring generally at the core of the system. Guidance for implementation of DSMS is provided by both the Mining Association of Canada (MAC) and the Canadian Dam Association (CDA), as well as several other organizations. The elements of a DSMS will be discussed, and how the systems have changed with time. At the core of a DSMS for a tailings dam and/or tailings embankment is ongoing slope stability analysis and, often, The Observational Method and Risk Management. The strategies for slope stability management have been evolving in industry, new guidance has been issued, and the key concepts of analysis and presentation of results will be provided.
Statistics

“For a world inventory of 18401 mine sites, the failure rate over the last one hundred years is estimated to be 1.2%” 1

Figure 1. Failure events over time.

1. Source: Azam, Li – “Tailings Dam Failures – A review of the last 100 years” Geotechnical News – December 2010
Statistics


NEW OCT 2018: Tailings Failure Database
https://worldminetailingsfailures.org/
Tailings Failures
How to prevent tailings dam failures

My view: A comprehensive Dam Safety Management System incorporating Risk management and Best practices

› Constantly evolving
› Good guidance from organizations
› Good regulations/legislation
› Qualified people
  • Competent Responsible Engineer (EOR)
  • Intelligent ITRB (reviews)
  • Engaged Staff
  • Committed Management
  • Educated Regulators
  • Informed Stakeholders
› Risk Management a function of Slope Stability

**An entire course could be spent on this topic**
Tailings/Dam Safety Management System

Two excellent references:


- Dam Safety Management System
  - A function of Owner’s policies and priorities, which is a function of Public Policy
- Process Driven
- Flow Chart of Plan, utilizes Plan, Do, Check, Act philosophy

From ICOLD Bulletin 154 (2011)
MAC Guidance Documents: Under review and revision (ongoing)

The Mining Association of Canada (MAC), has published a document entitled “A Guide to the Management of Tailing Facilities”, to monitor the tailing dam

- This Guide includes:
  - A framework of management principles, policies and objectives
  - Checklists for implementing the framework through the life cycle of a tailings facility
  - Lists of technical considerations

www.mining.ca
Other Resources Available

International Commission on Large Dams
› “Parent” organization to CDA
› Over 170 technical bulletins

International Council on Mining and Metals
› Largest mining companies in the world are members (sort of the international MAC)
› Following Samarco tailings failure, a global review of leading tailings practices
› 14 pages, easy read, with key recommendations
› No new information but potential implications to mining worldwide
Dam Safety Management System

- Tailings / Dam safety policy (corporate recognition)
- Planning
  - Work Program Component (the details)
  - Execution Responsibilities
- Standards and Procedures
- Resources
- Schedules
- Implementation
  - Operation
  - Maintenance
  - Surveillance
  - Emergency Preparedness
Damage Safety Management System

- Checking and Reviewing
  - Dam Surveillance and Dam Safety Reviews
  - Program peer reviews or review boards
  - Program Audits
  - Incident investigation
  - Testing of emergency preparedness
  - Equipment tests
- Corrective Actions – follow up to:
  - Peer Reviews and Audits
  - Incident investigations
  - Deficiencies and non-conformance

From ICOLD Bulletin 154 (2011)
Dam Safety Management System

› Reporting
  › Periodic reporting to management and regulator

› Supporting Processes
  › Staff training and qualification
  › Program communication
  › Record keeping and Management

From ICOLD Bulletin 154 (2011)
Dam Safety Management System

- Slope Stability Analysis involved at all stages:
  - Planning
  - Implementation
  - Checking & Reviewing
  - Corrective Actions
  - Reporting

- Observational Method
  - Predicted behaviour vs. Observed Behaviour
Slope Stability: Foundation of many DSMS

Where tailings embankments and/or tailings dams are constantly increasing in size, with consequence of failure being an uncontrolled release, ongoing Slope Stability Analysis is often a foundation of the DSMS.

The Overall DSMS represent a process to reconcile pieces of a management system with primary components:

- Slope Stability Management
- Performance Management
- Monitoring and Surveillance
- Risk Management

A DSMS without sound Slope Stability Analysis is not complete.
Slope Stability Analysis alone isn’t a DSMS.
Slope Stability Management

Slope Stability Assessment is a relatively simple assessment with complex considerations for input parameters.

A bit cliché: 50% science / 50% Art and/or Experience

But, Wait…

Stress Deformation Stability Analysis
Why movement does not ‘always’ mean FOS=1.0

FOS 1.38

Strain
Stability Analysis – What’s the Important Stuff?

1. Factor of Safety
2. Site characterization
3. Slope Stability Management
   › Surveillance & Monitoring
   › Performance Management
   › Risk Management

As an Owner, Regulator, Consultant or stakeholder, what are the key things I should understand?

Can we reduce to a TOP 3 LIST?
Factor of Safety

- Screening Level criteria
- If met, are generally viewed as acceptable practice (but doesn’t guarantee safety)
- However, if not met, further analysis by the design engineer may be required to support modified targets to demonstrate safety of the embankment (deformation analysis, additional investigations, enhanced use of observational method, etc.)

- The number you get is highly dependent upon input parameters
  - worst case conditions
  - Most probable conditions
    - Use the 80/20 Rule

---

### Resistance to sliding

\[ \text{Mobilizing Forces} \]

\[ \text{FOS} = \frac{\text{Resistance to sliding}}{\text{Mobilizing Forces}} \]

---

Table 3-4. Target Factors of Safety for Slope Stability of Mining Dams – Static Loading - Construction, Operation, and Transition Phases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Loading Condition</th>
<th>Minimum Factor of Safety</th>
<th>Slope</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>During or at end of construction prior to commencing of tailings deposition or impoundment of water</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Downstream and Upstream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After startup, during operations and transition, when tailings or water are being impounded, and during dam raise construction</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Downstream and Upstream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long term (steady state seepage, normal reservoir level)</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Downstream and Upstream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full or partial rapid drawdown</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Upstream slope</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

SNC-LAVALIN
Factor of Safety

Has the design engineer adequately described / accounted for how the input parameters were determined, AND the sensitivity to input parameters

What does this FOS mean?
Site Characterization

› Layers of Materials (stratigraphy)
  › Geologic History
  › Strength / behaviour of materials
  › Presence of weak materials
  › Presence of contractive soils

› Hydraulic Conditions
  › Instrumentation Installation and monitoring

› Again, the 80/20 rule is important

An entire workshop on it’s own
Has the design engineer have an adequate understanding of the stratigraphy, hydraulic conditions, and/or made conservative assumptions in the absence of this information?
Slope Stability Management

› Surveillance & Monitoring
  › Inspections and Instrumentation monitoring

› Performance Management
  › Observational Method (Peck, 1969)
    › Predicted vs. Observed behaviour
    › Pre-determined mitigation

› Risk Management
  › Risk a function of likelihood and consequences
    › Used to prioritize issues

Ongoing & Improving
Slope Stability Management

Is there an established management system?

Is there a system to evaluate predicted performance vs. observed performance?

Are the Risks understood?
Summary

› A robust, constantly improving Dam Safety Management System is required for the life of a structure (design through closure)

› Slope stability systems are an integral part of a DSMS where slopes exist (dykes, dams, tailings embankments)

› Slope stability modeling is applying relatively easy science, but requires significant consideration of the input parameters …. Requires qualified persons

› Factor of Safety is just a number – what is the slope telling us?
› Site characterization: 80/20 rule
› Slope stability management (Surveillance & Monitoring, Performance Management, Risk Management)

› More than just reporting a Factor of Safety number
Thank-you

Questions, comments, additional info: Chad.LePoudre@snclavalin.com